

Bibliography of External Critical Feedback for Extinction Rebellion

@nthnh, Feedback Subgroup, Jan. 2020

Introduction

This document was compiled over the course of about two months under the mandate of Extinction Rebellion NYC's Feedback Subgroup, a team formed following the 2019 October Rebellion which hopes to ensure that XR is reflecting and learning regularly. Grounded in XR's fifth principle: "We value reflecting and learning," these efforts help fulfill the full cycle of action, reflection, learning, and planning for the next action.

Change is a necessary function of survival for all biological life that lives in relationship with the world around it. As we humans seek to live in right relationship with our world, and with our fellow beings, we recognize that our own social environments are no different. As Octavia Butler wrote:

*All that you touch
You Change.*

*All that you Change
Changes you.*

Being attentive to the public discourse, and listening to external voices—even if we do not do what they ask—is essential if we hope to be a mass movement.

Background

This document is comprised of external feedback in the form of 139 Op-Eds, blog posts, vlogs, and other opinion-based pieces focused on Extinction Rebellion. As with any document of this scale, completed in a short period of time, there are limitations to what this bibliography can accomplish.

The limits of this bibliography are as follows:

1. Pieces included here were **published between November 2018 and November 2019**.
2. The bibliography is focused solely on **constructive/critical feedback**. Standard news coverage and purely positive coverage were not collected.
3. Sources' credibility was not evaluated. I would encourage you to use this document as an index to help you navigate feedback for XR.
4. I could only analyze English-language pieces.

5. The majority of the feedback is focused on XR UK and XR more generally.
6. The bibliography was completed by one person, to the best of my ability, with as much objectivity as I could muster. This work was completed over the course of only two months—I am sure there are errors. Please report errors to me on Keybase @nthnh.

Although Extinction Rebellion is beyond politics, much of the feedback for the movement, and the publications and forums which hosted feedback for us, are not. As such, to help with categorization, the pieces were initially split into liberal/left-leaning feedback and conservative/right-leaning feedback. I made a concerted effort to gather feedback from all political perspectives and found that feedback generally had a clear political viewpoint. All but one or two of the feedback pieces fit squarely into one of these two categories.

Although I was actively focused on constructive/critical feedback, I want to note that much of the liberal/left-leaning feedback came from people that were generally encouraged by the existence of a movement like XR.

As you navigate this document, I would ask that you embody XR's fourth principle: "We openly challenge ourselves and this toxic system." My goal, as compiler of this document, is not to change your mind about any particular issue, or about XR in general. I have simply made my best effort to provide something which can help the movement navigate the avalanche of feedback which our successes have brought. I hope that it will aid the movement in continuing to reflect and learn.

This document is intended for internal use only within the Self-Organizing System of XR NYC. Please take care when distributing this document and reach out to @nthnh on Keybase if you have questions about its use.

Feedback

The tables that follow are organized by argument, with statements in the left column and numbers to the right. Each number on the right is hyperlinked to a source which makes that argument.

Note: numbers do not correspond to specific articles. *The numbering restarts for each row of the table.* In case you are interested, the full list of 139 pieces can be found following this summary.

Although they may share some of the same conclusions, the sources vary greatly in their perspective. Please be sure to use the links in the right-hand column to explore sources' positions more deeply.

1. Intersectionality

One type of feedback from the Left focused on the perceived white and middle-class background of XR membership. Many commentators engaged less with bland statements that XR must be “more diverse” and focused on what they believed to be the core issues. In general, there was much discussion of the ways XR engages with marginalized people, especially in the context of race and class.

Liberal Feedback: Race, Class, Religion, and Ability	Sources
XR fails to interrogate the unequal effects of climate change and the potential unequal burdens of fighting it (such as for marginalized and working-class communities, and communities outside the “West”).	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12]
XR must center how climate change already affects people in the present, including folks in the Global South and people in working class communities in the Global North. XR should center a global just transition for all.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10]
XR is seemingly ignorant of historical and current movements and issues, especially many that are POC- and/or indigenous-led.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9]
XR is against the working class, working class members do not feel comfortable within the movement, and/or the concerns of working class members are dismissed. XR, like many mainstream environmental movements, fails to understand and support working class people. The past and current efforts of working class people are not valued or recognized.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9]
XR must follow the <i>leadership</i> of frontline communities that already experience ecological violence, centering their experiences and knowledge.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8]
XR needs to center a comprehensive acknowledgement of systemic injustice and intersectionality, and should engage in anti-oppression/decolonization work, addressing racism, sexism, classism, and other forms of oppression inside and outside the movement.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8]
XR’s primary focus on science as the justification for the movement and framing of climate emergency as the first and only existential threat to humanity appear to ignore and exclude the experiences/realities of marginalized communities.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
POC and other marginalized members of XR are not sufficiently supported and regularly experience microaggressions, tokenization, and other mistreatment. Their concerns are sidelined.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
White members of XR need to be educated about the ways that marginalized communities have historically addressed “environmental” issues (i.e., within a social justice framework or via local campaigns) so as to not reinforce the alienation of marginalized communities.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR’s aesthetic and culture, with strong influences from hippy and/or white middle-class life, put off people of other identities. This includes hiking and camping activities and meetings at bars/pubs.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR must bring POC, marginalized, and/or disrupted communities on board to be effective.	[1] [2] [3] [4]

A weakness of XR's decentralized structure is that it allows for actions to take place without input from POC/differently-abled/working-class voices. Decisions are made without these voices being heard because of the lack of a wider discussion and the position of those voices on the periphery.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR must support and/or build alliances with POC-led community, climate justice, and frontline direct action organizations. Predominantly white movements like XR should offer support and solidarity to autonomous struggles rather than aiming to include indigenous people, third world movements, and other marginalised groups within their own structure.	[1] [2] [3]
XR actions and tactics need to be accessible for disabled activists. XR has an ableism problem.	[1] [2] [3]
XR is overly defensive when challenged on its lack of diversity and fails to take meaningful steps toward resolving related issues. XR does not have the proper structures to deal with racism within the movement.	[1] [2] [3]
XR has thus far failed to stand in solidarity with the struggles of people of color, including indigenous peoples and peoples of the Middle East.	[1] [2] [3]
XR has a lot to learn about movement-building, courage, and survival from Black-led movement and must center the centuries-old knowledges of indigenous nations when building a vision of the future.	[1] [2]
XR tokenizes marginalized communities.	[1]
XR should have non-white spokespeople.	[1]
Some of XR's festival activities are culturally appropriative.	[1]

In particular, many commentators focused on the way XR's tactics intersect with police brutality.

Liberal Feedback: Arrests and Race	Sources
XR should not celebrate/glamorize/fetishize arrests. XR's focus on NVDA as their primary tactic leaves/pushes marginalized people and communities out of the movement.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20] [21] [22] [23]
XR needs to better acknowledge police brutality, change the way it interacts/collaborates with police, and highlight the racialized nature of policing.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19] [20]
The way XR members capitulate to arrest with zero resistance is alienating to POC folks.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8]
XR's strategy ignores the historic role of police in quelling mass movements via violence and disruption.	[1] [2]

On the Right, there was no discussion of race, but "working class" was a common calling card, although the term was not quite so precise, at times including anyone who was not a "globalist." Commentators on the Right were also concerned about how significant economic change would affect "normal" people.

Conservative Feedback: Class, “Globalism,” and the Economy	Sources
XR is elitist and against working class people.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14]
If XR gets what it wants it will bankrupt Western civilisation and (working class) people will be thrown into poverty. XR is a backwards movement that seeks to take us back to the Stone Age, undoing centuries of progress against disease, etc.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9]
Whether or not they know it, XR protesters are the pawns of globalist elite, sharing goals with the rich, international banks, and multinational corporations, who want to profit from climate emergency.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]
XR is eco-fascist (the conservative definition).	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
Some XR members’ ideas about reducing agricultural activity globally would cause global hunger and death, particularly for those in the Global South.	[1] [2] [3]
XR promotes fear and divides the public in order to convince people to support the expansion of globalist power and make them easier to govern.	[1] [2]
XR should be anti-corporation, including anti green corporatism (carbon offsets, carbon tax, etc.)	[1]

2. Tactics

Some feedback from the Left was concerned about XR’s mass arrest tactics outside the racial context. These commentators considered the way that XR engages with arrestees and non-arrestees, before, during, and after their actions.

Liberal Feedback: Arrests and Activists	Sources
XR recruits people who are politically inexperienced and does not properly prepare them, either ideologically or practically. In particular, arrestees are not adequately prepared or supported.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11]
XR’s pre-action communication with police and language around the roles of police as facilitators of action undermine the disruptive impact of its actions and put activists at risk.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR arrests harm people who care about the environment by giving them criminal records and making them vulnerable to police mistreatment.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
Arrests take momentum away from the movement while activists fight lengthy court battles.	[1]
XR’s focus on arrests reduces the impact of non-arrestable protesters and makes them into spectators rather than active participants.	[1]
XR fails to use secure (E2EE) communication and file management services, putting actions and activists at risk.	[1]

Some feedback also noted potential side effects of XR’s tactics.

Liberal Feedback: Arrests and Movement-Building	Sources
XR's method of time-limited, police-cooperative protests undermines the potential for "true" popular protest/revolution/insurrection.	[1] [2] [3]
XR's focus on tactics (especially arrests and disruption) can overshadow its demands.	[1] [2]

Commentators provided input on other aspects of XR's tactics, focusing in particular on XR's discussion of nonviolence, focus on governments, and strategies of disruption.

Liberal Feedback: Tactics	Sources
XR's misinterprets and/or is overdependent on Chenoweth's position on nonviolence. The paper is irrelevant and/or flawed.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8]
To be more effective, XR must use (less disruptive) tactics that do not antagonize "regular" folks.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6]
XR's actions will not be effective if they remain purely nonviolent.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
Rather than disrupting normal people, XR should focus on disrupting "the powers that be," decisively acting to disrupt pivotal leverage points in the existing system.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR should focus on capital (banks and hedge funds) and those in power in addition to governments.	[1] [2]
XR's disruptive tactics cause problems for disabled people.	[1] [2]
XR's strategies are performative and will have no real impact on governmental policy.	[1] [2]
XR's disruptive tactics enable the Right / climate deniers by providing them with fodder for their arguments against the movement.	[1]
Blocking pipelines and putting pressure directly on fossil fuel companies is more effective than blocking traffic, etc.	[1]
XR's strategies and tactics are based on a cherry picked and fundamentally flawed understanding of social science (not just Chenoweth).	[1]
XR is too focused on mobilizing people for mass actions rather than organizing around issues that affect people directly/locally.	[1]
XR should not disrupt public transportation, which is a more ethical mode of transport.	[1]
XR should ally itself with unions/labor groups in order to create greater disruption.	[1]

Discussions of tactics on the Right, however, were primarily frustrated with disruption caused by XR, and confused about how it might help XR achieve its goals. Ingrained in some of this

commentary was opposition to protest in general, although other commentary was more nuanced.

Conservative Feedback: Tactics	Sources
Blocking traffic is ineffective, turning people against XR, stopping people in need of medical attention, and/or potentially causing higher emissions from stopped traffic.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9]
XR is an extremist/eco-terrorist movement.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]
XR's actions and tactics, such as glueing-on, are pointless.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR's disruption of public transportation makes no sense because it is more "green" than regular transport.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR should not resort to illegal methods, but rather try to create change via the political system and traditional (legal) political activism.	[1] [2] [3]
Climate change is better solved by businessmen and university/innovation.	[1] [2] [3]
XR protesters should be at work, not protesting.	[1] [2]
XR endangers people (and may not be truly nonviolent) since it its roadblocks prevent medical care and affect travelers' livelihoods.	[1] [2]
XR protesters should try to change fossil fuel companies from within.	[1]
XR hypocritically causes pollution by blocking traffic and shutting down public transportation.	[1]
XR organizers should be arrested for keeping people from getting to work.	[1]
XR's disruptive actions inhibit the police's ability to deal with concurrent crime and have a negative effect on the economy.	[1]
XR's strategy of civil disobedience will eventually encourage policy brutality.	[1]

3. Politics

A significant portion of feedback from the Left was concerned with XR's political (or rather, apolitical) stance. Depending on their political position, many commentators believe that XR should take a political position. For left-wing authors, this position usually involved being explicitly anti-capitalist. For others, this involved engaging with the liberal political establishment.

Liberal Feedback: "Beyond Politics"	Sources
XR must be explicitly/openly anti-neoliberal, <u>anti-capitalist</u> , anti-imperialist, and/or anti-colonialist.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14] [15]
XR needs to be careful of eco-fascism and other right-wing populist (anti-immigrant) language. XR should consider a more explicit pro-migrant or anti-authoritarian stance.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14]

XR is just a rebranding of past failed (pro-capitalist, NGO-led) environmental movements.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]
XR should advocate for socialism in order to meet their demands.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6]
XR should not prohibit political affinity groups.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR should propose specific solutions to the climate crisis and/or specific legislation (e.g., the Green New Deal) and consider political alliances.	[1] [2] [3]
XR's demand that the government "tell the truth" is naive and ignores the fact that the true cause of climate change is capitalism.	[1] [2] [3]
XR needs to broaden its focus on ecological and climate justice to include issues such as migrant rights, reparations, climate debt, ecocide, and more. These issues must be baked into the movements demands, tactics, and principles. XR's demands fail to address the true cause of climate change: the global economic system.	[1] [2]
Socialists are infiltrating XR. This will discourage politically-unengaged and/or less-liberal people from joining.	[1]

Interestingly enough, much of the collected feedback from the Right already sees XR as an anti-capitalist movement, regardless of its apolitical positioning. [This article by Stuart Basden](#) was sometimes used as a source, but many commentators also perceived deeper left-wing elements within the movement.

Conservative Feedback: "Beyond Politics"	Sources
XR's core goals are liberal/anti-industry/socialist/anti-capitalist/anarchist indoctrination, revolution, and/or political gain. The Left is only using climate change as an excuse.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14] [15] [16]
XR founders/leaders are tricking environmentalists into participating in an "intersectional social justice" movement.	[1]
XR is supported by Russian propaganda.	[1]
XR has anti-Semitic associations.	[1]

4. Demands

A more focused area of political feedback from the Left was around perceived connections between XR and corporations. Some anti-corporate/anti-capitalist commentators engaged deeply with the ways that corporations could gain from XR's work.

Liberal Feedback: XR and Corporations	Sources
XR's efforts will only bolster the power of corporations and others in power. Their demands will only aid them in selling "green" products and building new infrastructure (etc). XR is pro-corporation/capitalism.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]

XR's goal of <u>net</u> -zero emissions (and references to a WWII-style mobilization) is pro-corporation, pro-fossil fuels, and pro-nuclear. It encourages profitable investment in the expansion of energy companies and creation of carbon offsets/carbon capture (as well as biodiversity offsets) rather than real political change.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR's reformist/capitalist demands will ensure that dominant countries and businesses stay on top while developing countries are not allowed to develop because of green policy.	[1] [2] [3]
XR's demands are too vague, allowing too much room for corporate/capitalist co-optation of the movement.	[1] [2] [3]
XR's activities only hand over more power to corporations and governments, and take power away from real people and communities. XR is used by corporate interests to create fear in order to help pass measures that are actually harmful to both people and the environment.	[1] [2] [3]
XR should oppose efforts to sustain industry and growth.	[1]
XR's avoidance of "blaming and shaming" exonerates the relatively small group of powerful individuals that are responsible for the majority of climate change.	[1]
The various free market (corporate) strategies that will be used to meet Net-Zero emissions demands will not be enough and may have negative effects for marginalized communities.	[1]
XR does not truly seek to disrupt government or corporate activity (i.e., business as usual), but rather to create a spectacle. XR does not believe that their actions will be effective.	[1]
XR needs to put forward a clearer articulation of how to fix our broken democracy.	[1]

Feedback from the Left also centers on XR's engagement with governments.

Liberal Feedback: The Government	Sources
XR needs to be clear about who has increased power when a climate emergency is declared, as it could manifest as authoritarian emergency powers or other harmful legislation.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR's strategies of civil disobedience may encourage violent repression from the government, and XR does not seem prepared for it.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR's strategies of pressuring local and national governments, even if partially successful, will not be sufficient to solve climate change because governments do not have enough power/control to solve the issue.	[1] [2] [3]
XR is a government-backed movement.	[1] [2] [3]
XR's demands of the government are misplaced. Governments cannot be trusted to tell the truth, and demanding that they arbitrate the truth is a dangerous proposition.	[1]
XR's demand that governments declare climate emergency does more	[1]

harm than good when governments do not back up their declarations with action.	
XR's strategies of civil disobedience may inhibit the potential of the government to negotiate in good faith.	[1]

On the Right, feedback regarding XR's demands varied more widely. In general, commentators felt that XR's demands were misplaced.

Conservative Feedback: Demands	Sources
XR and climate activists should focus on nuclear power, not renewable energy.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6]
XR should focus on polluters like China, Russia, and India, as well as other "non-Western" (non-white) industrialized nations.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6]
XR should provide solutions for climate change or suggestions for how to meet its emissions demand.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR's demands are unrealistic.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR is pointless because it is already too late and/or the establishment will never meet their demands.	[1] [2] [3]
XR should demand anti-immigration, anti-globalization, and other "America First" policies that will help them achieve their national demands.	[1] [2]
XR should focus on reducing emissions, not eliminating fossil fuels.	[1]
XR should demand an end to political campaign travel by politicians, limiting them to only local travel.	[1]

Some feedback from the Right asked why XR would focus on climate change at all.

Conservative Feedback: What About...	Sources
XR should pick up trash and/or deal with homelessness instead of protesting climate change.	[1] [2]
The government should focus on failing infrastructure rather than climate change.	[1]
XR should be more worried about Chinese human rights offences, etc.	[1]

5. Citizens' Assemblies

Feedback from both ends of the political spectrum was concerned with potential flaws in Citizens' Assemblies.

Liberal Feedback: Citizens' Assemblies	Sources
--	---------

XR's plan for a citizens' assembly might not provide people with enough power/knowledge/acumen to actually change the system. Whether directly or indirectly, the discussion will still be influenced and directed by government and business leaders, along with other "experts." It is an ideal that does not track with reality.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR's plan for a Citizens' Assembly is flawed because citizens of the Global South, and others more intensely affected by climate emergency, will likely not be represented within the framework.	[1]

Conservative Feedback: Citizens' Assemblies	Sources
XR's plan for Citizens' Assemblies is undemocratic.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6]
XR's idea of a Citizens' Assembly just copies the current (corrupt) democratic system.	[1] [2]

6. Messaging and Membership

Commentary on the Left regarding messaging and membership was wide-ranging, with a variety of ideas about how best to build a healthy mass movement. It also engaged with the way XR discussed individual complicity in climate breakdown.

Liberal Feedback: Messaging and Recruitment	Sources
XR's apocalyptic rhetoric will have a negative effect on the movement's longevity and wider appeal. XR needs to focus less on disruption and grief and more on building a positive, unifying collective narrative for the future.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR recruitment should focus on people of color and those on the left, rather than centrist and middle-class white people. XR's effectiveness is hampered by its inclusiveness of people with conservative political views.	[1] [2] [3]
XR must use language and tactics that do not alienate the political center/right. XR should seek to recruit people on the political center/right and convince them to change their views on climate change.	[1] [2]
XR should specifically promote veganism as the best way individuals can reduce their impact.	[1] [2]
XR should not shield individuals from their personal role/complicity in climate breakdown.	[1] [2]
The primary source of XR's issues is not, in fact, its ideology, but rather its messaging, which is often tone-deaf and aimed at the educated middle-class.	[1]
Much of XR's work seeks only to promote XR rather than promote climate justice.	[1]
XR's communication needs to go through channels that reach everyone, not just newspapers and academic journals that only reach certain types of people.	[1]

In addition to disruption, XR should focus on engaging and building connections with firms across society to forge channels of communication and education and lay the groundwork for systems change from within.	[1]
Mainstream climate movements like XR should focus on recruiting adults rather than children. The focus on children is a corporate-driven effort to create separation between generations.	[1]
XR needs to be clearer about the source of 3.5% and 51%.	[1]

Conservative feedback around XR’s messaging and recruitment was focused more on perceived negative effects on people’s lives. They also shared their feelings regarding the perceived hypocrisy of green movements.

Conservative Feedback: Messaging and Recruitment	Sources
XR seeks to use vulnerable, well-meaning, and/or gullible people, including children, young people, old people, and women as pawns.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10]
XR activists and celebrity supporters are hypocrites (flying/driving to actions, single-use plastics, rubber shoes, generators, etc.)	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10]
XR spreads PR/propaganda that convinces women not to have children and children that they will not grow up.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6]
XR wants you to stop eating meat.	[1] [2] [3]
XR is run by children who don’t understand logic or how the world really works (and adults who idealize them).	[1]
XR should focus on infiltrating conservative political parties / convincing conservative voters for the change they want to see.	[1]

Additional feedback from the right placed XR in the “greenie” stereotype, while also classifying the group as a cult due to perceived doomsday messaging and aesthetics.

Conservative Feedback: XR’s Aesthetic and Membership	Sources
XR is an apocalyptic cult, is cult-ish, and/or religious about their concern for the environment.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11]
XR activists just want attention. XR actions are just “virtue signalling.”	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8]
XR activists’ physical appearance, artsy activities, and costumes are funny/dumb/silly/dirty/ridiculous.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7]
XR is out of touch with regular people. It may care about “humanity” but it does not care about humans.	[1] [2] [3]
XR members are “crazy,” “loony,” “nutters,” etc.	[1] [2] [3]
XR activists do not represent the majority of people. They only represent a small group of “greenies.”	[1] [2]

XR promotes psychedelic use. XR may seek to drug people into supporting the environmental movement.	[1] [2]
XR's middle-to-upper class volunteers are paid to cause havoc/chaos.	[1]

7. Movement DNA

The last category of feedback from the Left was centered around the movement's core structures.

Liberal Feedback: Structure and DNA	Sources
XR should allow for discussion of tactics, demands, principles, politics, and other core ideas of the group. Not doing so is undemocratic.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8]
The powers of RisingUp / XR UK's bureaucratic "Holding Group" and other hierarchical structures (and informal patterns) contradict XR's principles of non-hierarchy, decentralization, and autonomy and limit the movements ability to adapt. XR's "leaders" should not benefit from celebrity status.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5]
XR is cult-ish.	[1] [2] [3]
XR's activities are unlikely to result in a revolutionary mass movement, in part because it was not born organically out of a struggle. Unlike the Civil Rights and Indian independence movements, XR is seeking comprehensive systems change.	[1] [2]
XR's emissions demand is not practical/possible.	[1] [2]
XR acts too quickly. It does not take enough time to reflect/plan.	[1]
XR conflates public support with the effectiveness of their movement/actions.	[1]
XR must establish democratic processes within the movement for selecting central role-holders and indicating the most important issues.	[1]
A weakness of the movement's long-term plans is that XR fails to spell out who will do the negotiating once negotiations have been forced.	[1]
XR misrepresents/overstates the scientific consensus.	[1]
XR's membership, made up of primarily urban dwellers, is disconnected from the natural world.	[1]

On the right, of course, many commentators believed the core issue to be that XR misinterprets science, and that no movement is required in the first place.

Conservative Feedback: Scientific Debate	Sources
XR's movement is based on faulty science and/or it exaggerates scientific findings.	[1] [2] [3] [4] [5] [6] [7] [8] [9] [10] [11] [12] [13] [14] [15] [16] [17] [18] [19]

Climate change does not exist; global warming is a lie/conspiracy/scam.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
Renewable energy systems and the process of creating them are more harmful, less ethical, and less efficient/effective than existing methods of fossil fuel extraction.	[1] [2] [3] [4]
XR does not allow for grey areas/debate about climate change.	[1] [2]

Conclusion

If you've made it this far, thank you! I hope that this resource will be useful to you and the whole movement as we work to achieve our demands.

If you have feedback regarding this guide, please feel free to send a message to Nathan @nthnh on Keybase.

Sources of External Critical Feedback for Extinction Rebellion

Title of Article (Hyperlinked)	Date Published/Updated	Publication
Liberal/Left		
Why I'm sceptical about the Extinction Rebellion initiative (and why I hope I'm wrong)	2018.11.01	Peace News
To succeed, environmental activists Extinction Rebellion must urgently change their attitude to the police	2018.11.06	The Canary
Extinction Rebellion – in or out?	2018.12.05	New Internationalist
Climate Change Ain't the First Existential Threat	2019.02.18	Medium: Race
Open Letter to Extinction Rebellion	2019.03.01	Green Anti-Capitalist Front
A Contradiction within the Extinction Rebellion.	2019.03.09	La Verda Planedo
Vegan or Die: The Importance of Confronting Climate Change	2019.03.11	Medium
Can Extinction Rebellion Aotearoa NZ help save the world?	2019.03.12	Aotearoa Workers Solidarity Movement
Extinction Rebellion: "Green" capitalism versus world socialism	2019.03.14	World Socialist Web Site
April 15th – Post-action report	2019.04.16	Green Anti-Capitalist Front
The End of the World as We Know It?	2019.04.16	Socialism or Your Money Back
The Truth about Extinction Rebellion	2019.04.16	Youtube - JourneyLT
Are Extinction Rebellion whitewashing climate justice?	2019.04.18	gal-dem
Lets talk about Extinction Rebellion	2019.04.18	thinking, doing, changing
Thoughts on Extinction Rebellion? The non-violent protest group blocking roads, train and airports in mostly London.	2019.04.18	r/Anarchy101
Extinction Rebellion Is Inspiring. But The Movement Risks Leaving People Of Colour Behind	2019.04.19	Huff Post
The Extinction Rebels have got their tactics badly wrong. Here's why	2019.04.19	The Guardian
Extinction Rebellion: disruption and arrests can bring social change	2019.04.20	The Conversation
I am an Extinction Rebellion Activist, and I have Regrets	2019.04.21	r/Anarchism
People of colour are the most impacted by climate change, yet Extinction Rebellion is erasing them from the conversation	2019.04.21	Independent
Notes on Extinction Rebellion	2019.04.22	Medium
Some @ExtinctionR people got the police involved, accusing a couple of young men of pickpocketing...	2019.04.22	Twitter
Rebelling Against Climate Death	2019.04.23	Jacobin
Extinction Rebellion: Socialist Revolution	2019.04.24	Architects for Social Housing
Rebellion Extinction: A Capitalist Scam to Hijack Our Resistance	2019.04.24	Wrong Kind of Green
What Extinction Rebellion needs to do next to win this fight	2019.04.24	Left Foot Forward
Extinction Rebellion, Protest and Class.	2019.04.25	Youtube - Red And Black
Extinction Rebellion's Self-Defeating Liberal Tactics Won't Stop Climate Change	2019.04.25	Protean Magazine
Selling Extinction	2019.04.26	YouTube - Prolekult
Trees Don't Grow on Money – or Why You Don't Get to Rebel Against Extinction	2019.04.29	Wrong Kind of Green
I was wrong about Extinction Rebellion. This is why.	2019.04.30	New Internationalist
XR have changed the conversation - and it's time for other activists to recognise that	2019.05.01	openDemocracy

An open letter to Extinction Rebellion	2019.05.03	Red Pepper
Does Extinction Rebellion Have a Race Problem?	2019.05.04	Fair Planet
Extinction Rebellion Training, or How to Control Radical Resistance from the 'obstructive Left'	2019.05.06	Wrong Kind of Green
To effect change, Extinction Rebellion must learn how to talk to right-wingers	2019.05.07	New Statesman America
My alarm about Climate Change & Extinction Rebellion	2019.05.15	Anarchist Writers
Exploring Violence, Non-violence & Extinction Rebellion - where XR gets the research wrong	2019.06.27	Anarchist Writers
The Socialist Workers Party is Infiltrating Extinction Rebellion	2019.06.30	London Green Left Blog
OPINION: Veganism Is The Next Logical Step For Extinction Rebellion	2019.07.16	Plant Based News
Extinction Rebellion uses tactics that toppled dictators – but we live in a liberal democracy	2019.07.18	The Conversation
Extinction Rebellion: Not the Struggle we Need, Pt. 1	2019.07.19	Out of the Woods
XR's gamble: the impossible turn	2019.07.21	r/ExtinctionRebellion
"Liberals, liberals, liberals! None of you are free from liberalism."	2019.07.27	r/ExtinctionRebellion
An Open Answer to Extinction Rebellion Köln	2019.08.31	Hambi bleibt!
Unpacking Extinction Rebellion — Part I: Net-zero Emissions	2019.09.13	Medium
Unpacking Extinction Rebellion — Part II: Goals and Tactics	2019.09.18	Medium
A Real Extinction Rebellion Means the End of Colonialism, Imperialism, and Capitalism	2019.09.22	Common Dreams
Unpacking Extinction Rebellion — Part III: The Fourth Industrial Revolution	2019.09.26	Medium
Does Extinction Rebellion have a race problem?	2019.10.04	The Guardian
How far is far enough in a climate emergency?	2019.10.04	The Outline
Extinction rebellion: right concern, wrong means	2019.10.08	Teller Report
Capitalising on Crisis: Extinction Rebellion and the Green New Deal for Capitalism	2019.10.10	Architects for Social Housing
It's time to add global justice to XR's demands	2019.10.10	Red Pepper
Room for change: the problem with Extinction Rebellion	2019.10.10	Huck
What are you doing to dismantle your middle class white privilege when participating in XR protests?	2019.10.10	Medium
A working-class green movement is out there but not getting the credit it deserves	2019.10.11	The Guardian
Extinction Rebellion Has a Politics Problem	2019.10.11	Current Affairs
Extinction Rebellion need to focus on the fact that climate displacement will largely impact communities of colour	2019.10.11	gal-dem
Extinction Rebellion: Must Climate Protest be Left?	2019.10.12	Teller Report
Here's the secret to Extinction Rebellion's explosive growth	2019.10.12	Wired
Can Extinction Rebellion Put Climate Change 'Beyond Politics'?	2019.10.14	The Nation
Extinction Rebellion and the Birth of a New Climate Politics	2019.10.15	New York Magazine
Extinction Rebellion's hapless stance on class and race is a depressing block to its climate justice goal	2019.10.15	Independent
The climate revolution must be accessible – this fight belongs to disabled people too	2019.10.15	The Guardian
It is not just a bunch of flowers	2019.10.16	Medium
Extinction Rebellion haven't thought about BAME people and it shows	2019.10.17	Metro
Is Annoying People the Right Way to Combat Climate Change?	2019.10.17	New York Magazine
Extinction Rebellion's commuter and science critics are missing the point	2019.10.18	The Conversation
Extinction Rebellion Needs More Working Class and POC Voices	2019.10.19	Fair Planet
When I look at Extinction Rebellion, all I see is white faces. That has to change	2019.10.19	The Guardian
Extinction Rebellion cannot go "beyond politics"	2019.10.21	Medium
Welcome to the free speech sub for Extinction Rebellion (XR)	2019.10.21	r/xrmed

Extinction Rebellion: We Need To Talk About The Future	2019.10.23	Medium
Extinction Rebellion: a short critical guide	2019.10.24	Overland
Extinction Rebellion, We Have A Problem	2019.10.28	EA Worldview
No, Extinction Rebels, nonviolence is not the only way	2019.10.28	Aotearoa Workers Solidarity Movement
The flawed social science behind Extinction Rebellion's change strategy	2019.10.28	Insurge Intelligence
Extinction Rebellion: Not the Struggle we Need, Pt. 2	2019.10.31	Out of the Woods
Extinction Rebellion: How Radical Climate Crisis Advocacy Became a Social Justice Battleground	2019.11.04	The Swaddle
Unpacking Extinction Rebellion — Part IV: The Way Forward	2019.11.04	Medium
Extinction Rebellion: Far from the Ecodicture	2019.11.06	Teller Report
What Would Net Zero Emissions by 2025 Look Like?	2019.11.15	how to save the world
Extraction Rebellion	2019.11.26	n+1
Conservative/Right		
Extinction Rebellion is a wannabe Marxist revolution in disguise	2018.11.21	The Spectator
Nudie Protests Just Hide the Naked Truth About Climate Change – It's a Massive Scam	2019.04.02	Breitbart
The New Green Threat: Extinction Rebellion	2019.04.02	The Ilmastotiede blog
Another Guardian Writer Calls for Rebellion to Save Us from Climate Change Extinction	2019.04.15	HVY Journalists
The European left's 'Extinction Rebellion' is more radical than even the 'Green New Deal'	2019.04.15	American Thinker
We're saved! Global warming alarmists 'gluing themselves to street furniture' to save the planet	2019.04.15	Twitchy
Enviro Loon Mob Shuts Down London	2019.04.16	Breitbart
Why hasn't the full force of the law been used against these eco anarchists who fill me with contempt?	2019.04.17	Daily Mail
Extinction Rebellion: A Nationalist's View	2019.04.18	Youtube - Way of the World
Privileged Hippies Bemoan Climate Apocalypse	2019.04.23	Liberty Nation
California is the Golden State of Homelessness and climate change activists just don't get it	2019.04.24	Fox News
Excuse Us While We Save The World	2019.04.26	American Greatness
The Extinction Rebellion Is Apparently Really, Really Silly	2019.04.27	RedState
Why Don't Climate Activists Support Nuclear Power?	2019.04.30	American Greatness
Rebelling against the Extinction Rebellion	2019.05.04	Climate, Etc.
Extinction Rebellion's Useful Idiots: Climate Alarmism Does Far More Harm Than Good	2019.05.22	Human Events
'Make the Economy Extinct!' Urge Labour, Radiohead and...the Conservatives	2019.06.11	Breitbart
Extremism Rebellion: A review of ideology and tactics	2019.07.01	Policy Exchange
Top Terror Cop Says 'Extinction Rebellion Are Dangerous Extremists. Jail Them!'	2019.07.18	Breitbart
Extinction Rebellion — British Green Fascism To Destroy Industrial Civilization	2019.08.01	LaRouche PAC
Exposed? Soros on List of Mega-Rich Extinction Rebellion Backers	2019.08.03	Breitbart
Extinction Rebellion: When Prophecy Fails	2019.08.05	BilloTheWisp
MEP Janice Atkinson: "What have the eco nutters Extinction Rebellion ever done for you?"	2019.08.21	Voice of Europe
Extinction Rebellion Wants A Mass Psychedelic Protest. Bad Idea.	2019.08.25	Democracy Chronicles
Climate strikers need to grow up	2019.09.23	Spiked
Climate Worship Is Nothing More Than Rebranded Paganism	2019.09.26	The Federalist
Extinction Rebellion would get a hell of a lot further if they infiltrated the Tory Party	2019.10.07	Independent

The madness of Extinction Rebellion	2019.10.07	Spiked
The Extinction Rebellion protesters are far more conservative than they realise	2019.10.08	Conservative Home
‘Shambolic, bizarre and upsetting’: Moment climate protesters lost us for good	2019.10.09	news.com.au
Extinction Rebellion is Not About Climate Change	2019.10.09	Youtube
Extinction Rebellion is an ‘anti-democratic’ and ‘anti-Western’ movement	2019.10.10	Sky News Australia
Extinction Rebellion, Our Future of Bugs & Pods	2019.10.10	RedIce
Extinction Rebellion/ Climate Emergency is 'divide and rule': the Establishment trolling the masses - and what else?	2019.10.10	Bruce Charlton's Notions
How Extinction Rebellion climate change zealots - including a baronet's Cambridge-educated granddaughter - are paid £400 a week to bring mayhem to our streets	2019.10.12	Daily Mail
‘Extinction Rebellion’ protesters choose hilariously apt mode of protest on Australian beach	2019.10.14	American Thinker
Climate's "Extinction Rebellion" and the Child Stalking Horse	2019.10.14	Gatestone Institute
The rebellion against reason	2019.10.14	American Thinker
Finally, a rebellion against Extinction Rebellion	2019.10.17	Spiked
Guilty Celebrities: Ignore Our Massive Carbon Footprints ... Please	2019.10.17	The Daily Wire
Londoners rebel against Extinction Rebellion	2019.10.17	Washington Examiner
Climate Change Extremism Isn't Popular, And It Never Will Be	2019.10.18	The Federalist
NIMBY "Extinction Rebellion" Sellouts Get Slammed in London	2019.10.18	Youtube
Extinction Rebellion's Emily Grossman Is A Type—As Nutty As You Would Expect	2019.10.19	VDare
Extinction Rebellion isn't about the Climate. It's about Heteronormativity	2019.10.20	Watts Up With That?
Radical Climate-Change Protests Coming Soon to a City Near You?	2019.10.20	National Review
This Rebellion Risks Its Own Extinction	2019.10.20	The Global Warming Policy Forum
UK Government Bans Extinction Rebellion Protests	2019.10.20	Youtube
‘Strangely silent’: Extinction Rebellion and others get informed where they should take their climate change protests	2019.10.21	Twitchy
Extinction Rebellion is Swiftly Turning Public Opinion Against Themselves	2019.10.22	Legal Insurrection
Rebel Against the Extinction Rebellion.	2019.10.22	Human Events
Climate Protestors FAIL at Activism (Extinction Rebellion Train-Stopping)	2019.10.25	Pseudo-Intellectual
Is It Climate Socialism – or Eco-Fascism?	2019.10.26	Townhall
NY Times's Cave Takes Side of Climate Cult 'Extinction Rebellion,' Disrupting Ordinary Life	2019.11.08	NewsBusters
XR Climate Activists “Please STOP Telling Children They May Not Grow Up” - Says IPCC Lead Author In Tweet	2019.11.08	Science 2.0
<i>Questions about this spreadsheet? Email nthnh@pm.me.</i>		